Fallacies

formal, informal, rhetorical & statistical
Formal fallacies

• A logical *argument* that is not *valid*
  – Valid: The premises fit & prove the conclusion
  – For example:
    All S is M.
    All P is M.
    Therefore, all S is P.
Formal fallacies

• A logical *argument* that is not *valid*

  – For example:
    All rabbits run fast.
    Homare Sawa runs fast.
  Therefore, Homare Sawa is a rabbit.
Formal fallacies

- A logical *argument* that is not *valid*

Compare a valid example:

All rabbits run fast.
Homare Sawa is a rabbit.
Therefore, Homare Sawa runs fast.
Rhetorical (informal) fallacies

• (Some) Attempts to convince without logic
  – People instead of premises, data
    Everybody says it, so it must be true.
    Stupid people say it, so it must be false.
  – Ignorance/knowledge instead of logic
    We don’t know it’s not true...
    This is a good idea, so it must be true.
Statistical fallacies

• Misunderstanding / misrepresenting statistics
  It’s significant (p<0.01), so it’s important.
  The temperature has been going down since September. By June we’ll be freezing.

• Calculating incorrectly, improperly
  All my friends agree with me.
  Therefore, everyone agrees with me.
Chocolate & Nobel Prizes

Figure 1. Correlation between Countries' Annual Per Capita Chocolate Consumption and the Number of Nobel Laureates per 10 Million Population.

Messrli
2012
Chocolate & Nobel Prizes

Maurage et al. 2013
Chocolate & Nobel Prizes

Maurage et al.
2013
Chocolate & Nobel Prizes

Maurage et al.
2013
Sunlight correlates with vacations

Sunlight in Florida correlates with Visitors to Universal Orlando Islands of Adventure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sunlight in Florida (KJ/sq.m) (CDC)</th>
<th>2007</th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Visitors to Universal Orlando Islands of Adventure (TEA)</td>
<td>5.43</td>
<td>5.297</td>
<td>4.627</td>
<td>5.949</td>
<td>7.674</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Correlation: 0.89205

Courtesy of tylervigen.com
Japanese cars & US suicides

Japanese passenger cars sold in the US correlates with Suicides by crashing of motor vehicle

Suicides by crashing

Japanese cars sold

1999 2000 2001 2002 2003 2004 2005 2006 2007 2008 2009

140 suicides
120 suicides
100 suicides
80 suicides

600 thousand cars
800 thousand cars
1000 thousand cars
1200 thousand cars

Courtesy of tylervigen.com
Government

Can you spot the fallacy?
British politicians’ bargain

• 2011: British politicians say government wastes £10bn (¥2兆) per year

• Ben Goldacre read the report to check their calculation.
  
  http://www.badsceince.net/2012/04/is-this-the-worst-government-statistic-ever-created/
British politicians’ bargain

Government workers’ mobile phones are from an expensive company. If their mobile phones were from a different company, they would be 20% cheaper.

City government spends £50bn per year on all programs. If they can save 20%, that is £10bn.
British politicians’ bargain

Government workers’ mobile phones are from an expensive company. If their mobile phones were from a different company, they would be 20% cheaper.

City government spends £50bn per year on all programs. If they can save 20%, that is £10bn.

Most spending is not for mobile phones. Phones cost the government £600,000 per year. If they save 20%, that is £120,000 (£0.00012bn).

Extrapolation fallacy

programs. If they can save 20%, that is £10bn.
Bad charts
Bad charts
Both charts based on the same numbers
But this one is only the top 0.0004% of the range
Be careful
This is the top 50% of the range.
Language, Psychology

Can you spot the fallacy?
Word aversion

Many English speakers say they hate the word *moist*. They say they dislike its sound, but maybe they actually dislike its meaning. Thibodeau et al. (2015) asked people to rate whether they like or dislike several words. Although 21% dislike *moist*, those same people did not dislike *hoist* or *rejoiced*. Therefore, people who dislike the word *moist* dislike its meaning, not its sound.
Many English speakers say they hate the word *moist*. They say they dislike its sound, but maybe they actually dislike its meaning. Thibodeau et al. (2015) asked people to rate whether they like or dislike several words. Although 21% dislike *moist*, those same people did not dislike *hoist* or *rejoiced*. Therefore, people who dislike the word *moist* dislike its meaning, not its sound.
Word aversion

Many English speakers say they hate the word *moist*. Thibodeau et al. (2015) asked people to rate whether they like or dislike several words. Although 21% dislike *moist*, those same people did not dislike *hoist* or *rejoiced*. Therefore, people who dislike the word *moist* dislike its meaning, not its sound.

“A is False” does not necessarily mean “B is True.”

**False Dilemma**
Economics

Can you spot the fallacy?
Growth vs. debt

Reinhart & Rogoff (2010) compared economic growth and government debt. They found little connection. But when debt is more than 90% of GDP, growth drops dramatically.

Herndon et al. (2013) couldn’t duplicate Reinhart & Rogoff’s findings. Eventually they found that Reinhart & Rogoff had made a computer error that caused their statistics to be calculated incorrectly.
GDP Growth vs. Public Debt

Reinhart & Rogoff 2010
Herndon et al. 2013
Growth vs. debt

Reinhart & Rogoff, who oppose big debt for political reasons, found that big debt is bad.

Herndon et al. found that big debt does not have much effect. (Small debt has a good effect, but politicians don’t argue about that.)

1. Garbage in, garbage out

2. Beware of finding what you are looking for.
Sociology and Communication

Can you spot the fallacy?
Canvassing

People rarely change their political positions. Lacour & Green (2014) found that when an interviewer says that he or she is gay, the people being interviewed are more likely to change their positions about gay marriage.
Canvassing

This was not a fallacy – it was a lie. Lacour made up fake data to “prove” the effectiveness of his canvassing techniques.

The respected journal *Science* published the paper and peer reviewers accepted it in part because Green is a very well-known and respected scholar in this field. One reviewer said, “I trust anything Don Green says.”

When he discovered the lie, Green asked *Science* to retract the paper.
The fallacy fallacy

Videos are available on YouTube from PBS Idea Channel